



Public Availability of Inoperative Agency Guidance Documents

Committee on Regulation

Proposed Recommendation for Committee | ~~October 20~~ November 3, 2021

1 Agencies issue guidance documents to help explain their programs and policies,
2 announce their interpretation of laws, and communicate other important information to regulated
3 entities, regulatory beneficiaries, and the broader public.¹ The Administrative Conference has
4 issued several recent recommendations regarding guidance documents.² Among them was
5 Recommendation 2019-3, *Public Availability of Agency Guidance Documents*, which encourages
6 agencies to facilitate public access to guidance documents on their websites.

7 Over time, a given guidance document may no longer reflect an agency's position. An
8 agency may rescind the document in whole or in part by announcing that it no longer reflects the
9 agency's position. Even without being rescinded in whole or in part, a guidance document can be
10 superseded in whole or in part by later statutory, regulatory, or judicial developments, or it can
11 fall into disuse in whole or in part. The present Recommendation terms these documents
12 "inoperative guidance documents."

13 Some inoperative guidance documents will be of interest to the public because they
14 disclose how an agency's legal interpretations have changed³ or how policies or programs have

¹ This Recommendation defines "guidance document" as does Recommendation 2019-3, *Public Availability of Agency Guidance Documents*, to mean "interpretive rules," "general statements of policy," see 5 U.S.C. § 553 (d), and "other materials considered to be guidance documents under other, separate definitions adopted by government agencies." See Admin. Conf. of the U.S., Recommendation 2019-3, *Public Availability of Agency Guidance Documents*, 84 Fed. Reg. 38931, 38931 (Aug. 8, 2019).

² See, e.g., Recommendation 2019-3, *supra* note 1; Admin. Conf. of the U.S., Recommendation 2019-1, *Agency Guidance Through Interpretive Rules*, 84 Fed. Reg. 38927 (Aug. 8, 2019); Admin. Conf. of the U.S., Recommendation 2017-5, *Agency Guidance Through Policy Statements*, 82 Fed. Reg. 61734 (Dec. 29, 2017); Admin. Conf. of the U.S., Recommendation 2014-3, *Guidance in the Rulemaking Process*, 79 Fed. Reg. 35992 (June 25, 2014).

³ See Blake Emerson & Ronald Levin, *Agency Guidance Through Interpretive Rules: Research and Analysis* (May 28, 2019) (report to the Admin. Conf. of the U.S.).



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

15 changed over time.⁴ But if these documents are not posted on an agency’s website, they will be
16 either inaccessible (except through a Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) request), in the case of
17 documents not published in the *Federal Register*, or not as accessible as they should be, in the
18 case of documents that appeared in the *Federal Register*.⁵

19 Three statutes require agencies to make some inoperative guidance documents publicly
20 available. The Federal Records Act requires agencies to post on their websites materials that are
21 of “general interest or use to the public.”⁶ FOIA requires agencies to publish notices in the
22 *Federal Register* when they have rescinded or partially rescinded guidance documents that are
23 addressed to the public generally rather than to specific individuals or organizations.⁷ The E-
24 Government Act requires agencies to publish these rescission and partial rescission notices on
25 their websites.⁸ Many agencies have also issued regulations pertaining to the public availability
26 of their inoperative guidance documents.

27 The Office of Management and Budget’s 2007 *Final Bulletin for Agency Good Guidance*
28 *Practices* imposes additional requirements on agencies relating to inoperative guidance
29 documents. It directs all agencies other than independent regulatory agencies to post notices on
30 their websites whenever they have rescinded or partially rescinded significant guidance
31 documents and to keep those notices in place for a year.⁹ It also states that such agencies should
32 stamp or otherwise prominently identify as “superseded” those significant guidance documents
33 that have become inoperative but which remain available for historical purposes.

⁴ See Nicholas R. Parrillo, *Agency Guidance Through Policy Statements: An Institutional Perspective* (Oct. 12, 2017) (report to the Admin. Conf. of the U.S.).

⁵ See Recommendation 2019-3, *supra* note 1.

⁶ See 44 U.S.C. § 3102 (2).

⁷ See 5 U.S.C. § 552 (a)(1); *Nat’l Org. of Veterans’ Advocs., Inc. v. Sec’y of Veterans Affairs*, 981 F.3d 1360, 1375 (Fed. Cir. 2020).

⁸ See E-Government Act of 2002, Pub. L. No. 107-347, § 206, 116 Stat. 2899, 2916 (codified at 44 U.S.C. § 3501 note).

⁹ See OFFICE OF MGMT. & BUDGET, EXEC. OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT, OMB BULL. NO. 07-02, FINAL BULLETIN FOR AGENCY GOOD GUIDANCE PRACTICES (2007).



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

34 Recommendation 2019-3, though concerned primarily with operative guidance
35 documents, makes several recommendations relating to the posting of inoperative guidance
36 documents. In summary, it recommends that agencies (1) mark posted guidance documents to
37 indicate whether they are current or were withdrawn or rescinded and (2) in the case of rescinded
38 or withdrawn documents, note their rescission or withdrawal date and provide links to any
39 successor document.

40 Recommendation 2019-3 reserved the question, however, of which inoperative guidance
41 documents agencies should publish online. This Recommendation takes up that issue, building
42 on the principles Recommendation 2019-3 set forth for operative documents by extending them,
43 as appropriate, to inoperative guidance documents. Specifically, it advises agencies to develop
44 written procedures for publishing inoperative guidance documents, devise effective strategies for
45 labeling and organizing such documents on their websites, and deploy other means of
46 disseminating information about such documents.¹⁰

47 This Recommendation, like Recommendation 2019-3, accounts for differences across
48 agencies in terms of the number of guidance documents they issue, how they use guidance
49 documents, and their resources and capacities for managing online access to these documents.
50 Accordingly, this Recommendation does not advise agencies to post all of their inoperative
51 guidance documents online.

52 This Recommendation is limited to guidance documents that become inoperative in the
53 future. Agencies may, of course, choose to apply it retrospectively to existing inoperative
54 guidance documents.

¹⁰ Several paragraphs of this Recommendation directly or indirectly apply the paragraphs of Recommendation 2019-3, *supra* note 1, to inoperative guidance documents. Compare Paragraph 1 of this Recommendation with Recommendation 2019-3, ¶ 1; Paragraph 3 with Recommendation 2019-3, ¶¶ 4, 7, and 9; Paragraph 4 with Recommendation 2019-3, ¶ 8; and Paragraph 6 with Recommendation 2019-3, ¶ 11.



RECOMMENDATION

Deciding Which Types of Inoperative Guidance Documents to Make Publicly Available on Agencies' Websites

55 1. AgenciesEach agency should ~~determine which types~~develop and publish on its website
56 written procedures governing the public availability of inoperative guidance documents
57 and should consider doing the following in its procedures:

58 a. Defining what it considers to be an "inoperative guidance document," with
59 consideration of categories such as rescinded guidance documents, partially
60 rescinded guidance documents, superseded guidance documents, partially
61 superseded guidance documents, and guidance documents that have been
62 rescinded, superseded, or have fallen into disuse (collectively "in whole or in part;

63 b. Specifying how it will notify the public when a guidance document has been
64 rescinded, partially rescinded, superseded, partially superseded, or has fallen into
65 disuse in whole or in part;

66 a-c. Identifying, as elaborated in Paragraph 2 below, which kinds of inoperative
67 guidance documents") should be made publicly available on their websites.
68 its website;

69 b.d. In determining which types ofSpecifying how long inoperative guidance
70 documents are to make publicly availablebe retained on their websites, agencies
71 should consider, among others, the following factors:its website;

72 e. Whether theSpecifying whether some types of previously unpublished operative
73 documents are to be posted on its website when they become inoperative and, if
74 so, under what circumstances;

75 f. Providing for how inoperative guidance documents appear to be of interestare to
76 thebe organized on its website to facilitate searching and public access;

77 a.Identifying, as indicated by many unique page views or downloads of the
78 documents (either while the documents were operative or while they were



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

79 ~~inoperative but already made available) or by many unique inquiries about the~~
80 ~~documents;~~

- 81 ~~g. Whether elaborated in Paragraph 3 below, what labels and explanations it will use~~
82 ~~to communicate clearly the inoperative status of guidance documents; and~~
83 ~~h. Indicating whether any or all of the procedures should be applied retroactively.~~

Determining Which Kinds of Inoperative Guidance Documents to Publish Online

84 2. ~~In deciding which kinds of inoperative guidance documents to post on its website, an~~
85 ~~agency should at least consider the following factors:~~

- 86 a. ~~Whether it previously posted the operative version of the inoperative guidance~~
87 ~~document on its website;~~
88 b. ~~Whether its current policy for posting operative guidance documents, while would~~
89 ~~call for posting such an inoperative guidance document if it were operative;~~
90 c. ~~Whether the inoperative guidance document generates—or, when it was~~
91 ~~operative, generated—numerous unique inquiries from the public;~~
92 d. ~~Whether the inoperative guidance document generated reliance interests, as~~
93 ~~indicated by frequent citations of the when it was operative versions of;~~
94 e.e. ~~Whether the inoperative guidance document is—or, when operative, was—the~~
95 ~~subject of attention in the general media or specialized publications relevant to the~~
96 ~~agency, or has been cited frequently in other agency documents in regulations,~~
97 ~~such as permits, licenses, grants, loans, contracts, or briefs, or news sources, or~~
98 ~~substantial public feedback; or;~~
99 f. ~~Whether the operative version of an inoperative guidance documents,~~
100 ~~while document generated a high level of public participation when it was~~
101 ~~originally being formulated; and~~
102 d.g. ~~Whether the inoperative guidance document, when it was operative, dealt with~~
103 ~~issues of widespread significance or controversial matters, as indicated by~~
104 ~~submission originally being formulated, had been submitted to the Office of~~

Commented [TR1]: Note for Committee: The intention here is not to suggest that an agency consider each of its inoperative guidance documents against these factors. Rather, the intention is to suggest that an agency consider these factors in deciding on the categories of inoperative guidance documents to publish online. We welcome the committee's input on whether the current wording reflects that intent.



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

105 Information and Regulatory Affairs ~~of the operative versions of the guidance~~
106 ~~documents or publication in the agencies' or published in the agency's~~ *Unified*
107 *Agenda of the same.*

~~Establishing Written Procedures for Inoperative Guidance Documents~~

- 108 ~~2. Agencies should develop and publish on their websites written procedures governing the~~
109 ~~storage and display of those inoperative guidance documents the agencies have~~
110 ~~determined should be made publicly available on their websites. These procedures should~~
111 ~~either be part of their general procedures governing storage and display of their guidance~~
112 ~~documents or can be stand-alone procedures. At a minimum, these procedures should:~~
113 ~~a. Provide for how inoperative guidance documents are to be compiled and~~
114 ~~organized on agencies' websites to make it easy for the public to find the~~
115 ~~inoperative guidance documents in which they are interested; and~~
116 ~~b. Specify the labels and explanations agencies will use to ensure the public can~~
117 ~~readily understand the significance and effect of inoperative guidance documents.~~

~~Organizing and Labeling Inoperative Guidance Documents on Agencies'~~ ~~Websites Available Online~~

- 118 ~~3. Agencies~~Each agency should organize ~~its~~ inoperative guidance documents on ~~their~~
119 ~~websites~~its website to make it easy for ~~members of~~ the public to find ~~them~~. The agency
120 ~~should consider one or more of the following approaches:~~
121 ~~a. Assigning a unique guidance identification number to each~~ inoperative guidance
122 ~~documents in which they are interested. Among~~document, if such a number had
123 ~~not already been assigned when~~ the ~~options agencies should consider, alone or in~~
124 ~~tandem with one another, are:~~document was operative;
125 ~~b. Creating a table that is indexed, tagged, or sortable, and is dedicated exclusively~~
126 ~~to~~housingdisplaying entries for inoperative guidance documents, with links to
127 such documents;



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

- 128 c. Providing a search function that ~~uncover~~enables retrieval of inoperative guidance
129 documents; and
- 130 d. Using a method, such as a pull-down menu, that allows the public to view
131 inoperative guidance documents ~~at different points in time, with an indication on~~
132 ~~all inoperative versions of the documents~~ and ~~see~~ that they are inoperative.

133 ~~3.4. Agencies~~Each agency should label inoperative guidance documents on ~~their websites~~its
134 ~~website~~ to ensure that the public can readily understand the ~~significance and~~
135 ~~effect in operative status~~ of those guidance documents. ~~Among the~~The agency should
136 ~~consider adopting one or more of the following~~ labeling methods ~~agencies should~~
137 ~~consider, alone or in tandem with one another, are~~ and ~~using the selected method or~~
138 ~~methods consistently for all inoperative guidance documents:~~

- 139 a. Including a watermark that ~~reads~~displays “rescinded,” ~~“partially rescinded,”~~
140 ~~“superseded,” “partially superseded,” “not in use,” or uses~~ similar terminology; ~~as~~
141 ~~appropriate~~ across each page of ~~an~~ inoperative guidance ~~documents~~document;
- 142 b. Including ~~words such as “rescinded,” “partially rescinded,” “superseded,”~~
143 ~~“partially superseded,” “not in use,” or similar terminology as appropriate within~~
144 ~~a table in which links to inoperative guidance documents appear;~~
- 145 c. ~~Posting a redline version of a guidance document that has been partially~~
146 ~~rescinded, showing the exact revisions;~~
- 147 d. Including a prominent ~~stamps~~stamp at the top of ~~an~~ inoperative guidance
148 ~~documents~~document noting that the ~~documents are rescinded~~document is
149 ~~inoperative~~ and indicating the ~~dates~~date it became inoperative;
- 150 e. ~~Providing cross references, with links, from an inoperative guidance document to~~
151 ~~any successor versions of the guidance document, and vice versa; and~~
- 152 b. ~~Publishing a notice~~ of rescission;
- 153 e. f. ~~Publishing notices of or partial~~ rescission ~~of a guidance document on agencies’~~
154 ~~websites~~the agency’s website and providing links to ~~such notice in the notices in~~
155 inoperative guidance ~~documents; and~~document.



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

156 ~~d. Including the word “rescinded,” or similar terminology, within a table in which~~
157 ~~links to inoperative guidance documents appear.~~

**Using ~~Means Other Than Agencies’ Websites~~ Means to Notify the Public of the
~~Rescission and Posting of Inoperative Guidance Documents~~**

158 5. Agencies ~~At a minimum, an agency should notify the public that a guidance document has~~
159 ~~become inoperative in the same way that it notified the public that the operative version~~
160 ~~of the guidance document was issued, or in the same way it would notify the public that~~
161 ~~an operative version of the guidance document has been issued under the agency’s~~
162 ~~current policies.~~

163 4.6. An agency ~~should consider using the following methods, alone or in conjunction with one~~
164 ~~another, or more of the following methods~~ to notify the public when ~~they have rescinded a~~
165 ~~guidance documents and document has become inoperative or~~ to notify the public that ~~the~~
166 ~~inoperative guidance documents are document is~~ available on ~~their websites its website:~~

- 167 a. Publishing such ~~notifications notification~~ in the *Federal Register*, even when not
168 required to do so by law;
- 169 b. Sending such ~~notifications notification~~ over ~~listservs that consist of interested~~
170 ~~members of the public an agency listserv or to a similar mailing list to which the~~
171 ~~public can subscribe;~~
- 172 c. Conveying such ~~notifications notification~~ during virtual meetings, in-person
173 meetings, or webinars; ~~involving the public; and~~
- 174 ~~d. Conveying such notifications notification through a press releases; and~~
175 ~~e. d. Using or developing subscription services to allow the public to subscribe to such~~
176 ~~notifications; release.~~