

Online Processes in Agency Adjudication

Committee on Adjudication

Draft Recommendation for Committee | April 20, 2023

1 [Preamble To Come]

RECOMMENDATION

Accessing Online Processes

| 2 | 1. | Agenc | ies should ensure that online processes used by members of the public work |
|----|----|---------|---|
| 3 | | effecti | vely with any electronic case management system (eCMS) and any website where |
| 4 | | agency | y adjudication materials are made publicly available. |
| 5 | 2. | Agenc | ies should develop online self-help portals that allow users to, as applicable: |
| 6 | | a. | Update contact information, including email addresses, phone numbers, and |
| 7 | | | physical addresses; |
| 8 | | b. | Complete and submit forms; |
| 9 | | c. | File briefs, evidence, and other documents; |
| 10 | | d. | Receive service of documents, including documents filed by other parties and |
| 11 | | | agency notices and orders; |
| 12 | | e. | View and download case documents; |
| 13 | | f. | Make payments (e.g., filing fees, application fees, civil penalties); |
| 14 | | g. | Schedule meetings, conferences, hearings, and other appointments; |
| 15 | | h. | Access virtual appointments; |
| 16 | | i. | View case status information and information about deadlines, appointments, and |
| 17 | | | wait times, but only if they can reliably predict them; |
| 18 | | j. | Receive reminders about upcoming deadlines and appointments; and |
| | | | |

1



| 19 | | k. Receive notifications about new documents, status changes, and other | |
|----|----|--|---|
| 20 | | developments in their cases. | |
| 21 | 3. | Online self-help portals should be designed to allow different functionality, with | |
| 22 | | appropriate permissions, for different types of users including parties, intervenors, | |
| 23 | | representatives and their staff, and amici curiae. | |
| 24 | 4. | Agencies should ensure online self-help portals have security mechanisms in place to | |
| 25 | | protect user privacy. Agencies that require users to register for and log in to online self- | |
| 26 | | help portals should allow users to use Login.gov or other universal login used by | |
| 27 | | government agencies. | |
| | | Electronic Filing and Forms | |
| | | Electronic rining and Forms | |
| 28 | 5. | Agencies should permit all parties and require all represented parties to file documents | Commented [MG1]: Question for the Committee: Would it be a "best" practice at this point to make e-filing the default? |
| 29 | | electronically, except in instances when electronic filing would be impossible or | be a best practice at this point to make e-ming the default? |
| 30 | | impracticable or a party has good cause for needing alternative means of submission. | |
| 31 | 6. | Agencies should ensure that their processes for electronic filing allow all users to, as | |
| 32 | | applicable: | |
| 33 | | a. File documents in batch; | |
| 34 | | b. File documents at significant size to allow for all common filings; | |
| 35 | | c. File documents in multiple file formats, except that users should be required to | |
| 36 | | file documents in a format that cannot be edited, such as Portable Document | |
| 37 | | Format (PDF), unless a specific procedure requires parties to submit documents | |
| 38 | | that can be edited (e.g., a proposed order); | |
| 39 | | d. Notify the agency that documents being filed contain legally protected or other | |
| 40 | | sensitive information; and | |
| 41 | | e. Notify the agency that documents are being filed under seal or in camera. | |
| 42 | 7. | Agencies without an eCMS should allow parties to file briefs, evidence, and other | |
| 43 | | documents electronically, by emailing documents to a designated agency email address, | |
| 44 | | uploading them to a web-accessible file-hosting service, or transferring them to the | |
| 45 | | agency using the file transfer protocol (FTP). | |

2



| 46 | 8. | Agencies with an eCMS should develop web-based tools that can be used to submit |
|----|----|---|
| 47 | | documents directly into the eCMS. These tools should allow users to input structured |
| 48 | | metadata collected by the eCMS, such as document type, so long as it would not be |
| 49 | | confusing or burdensome for members of the public to do so. |
| 50 | 9. | Agencies with an eCMS should develop application programming interfaces (APIs) that |
| 51 | | allow users, such as representatives, who use their own eCMS to directly transfer data |
| 52 | | between a user's eCMS and the agency's eCMS, without needing to use an online form |
| 53 | | or self-help portal as an intermediary. |
| 54 | 10 | . Agencies that have forms or templates for use in adjudications (e.g., applications, |
| 55 | | appointment of representative, hearing requests, requests for agency appellate review, |
| 56 | | subpoena requests) should post PDF versions of the forms on their websites and allow |
| 57 | | users to complete, sign, and submit them electronically. Agencies should adapt frequently |
| 58 | | used forms as web-based forms that users can complete and submit using a web browser. |
| 59 | | When feasible, web-based forms should: |
| 60 | | a. Be prepopulated with information about a user or case that the agency already has |
| 61 | | collected in an eCMS or other database; and |
| 62 | | b. Based on prepopulated data and previous responses, only require users to answer |
| 63 | | questions that are relevant to them. |
| 64 | 11 | . Except when explicitly prohibited by statute, agencies should allow participants in |
| 65 | | adjudications to sign documents electronically and, as applicable, should accept the |
| 66 | | following as valid electronic signatures: |
| 67 | | a. Submitting a form or document through an agency's online self-help portal while |
| 68 | | registered for and logged in to the portal; |
| 69 | | b. A cryptographic digital signature; |
| 70 | | c. A scanned or other graphical representation of a handwritten signature; |
| 71 | | d. A conformed signature (e.g., "/s/ Jane Doe"); and |
| 72 | | e. An email used to transmit the document. |
| 73 | 12 | . Agencies should only review electronically filed documents before associating them with |
| 74 | | a case file if there is a need to do so, for example to ensure nondisclosure of legally |

3



| 75 | protected or other sensitive information, for quality assurance purposes, or when a party |
|----|---|
| 76 | files or requests to file a document under seal or in camera. |

Electronic Service

| 77 | 13. Agencies should allow parties to serve documents to other represented parties |
|----|--|
| 78 | electronically, except in instances when electronic service would be impossible or |
| 79 | impracticable or a party has good cause for needing alternative means of delivery. |
| 80 | 14. Agencies without an eCMS should allow parties to serve documents to other parties |
| 81 | electronically, by emailing documents to other parties. In addition, or as an alternative, |
| 82 | agencies that allow parties to submit documents using a file-hosting service or FTP |
| 83 | should notify other parties when new documents become available. |

Management of Sensitive Documents

- Agencies that redact legally protected or other sensitive information from documents
 before making them available to other parties or publicly available should clarify whether
 parties should submit redacted versions of documents or whether the agency will make
- 87 redactions.

Fees and Other Payments

16. Agencies that require filing fees, application fees, payment of civil penalties, or other
 payments should accept electronic payments.

Scheduling, Notifications, and Reminders

- 17. Agencies should, as applicable, allow parties to use an appointment-booking tool or
 scheduling tool to help schedule meetings, conferences, hearings, and other appointments
 efficiently and at times that are reasonably convenient for the agency and all non-agency
 participants.
- 94 18. Agencies with an eCMS should provide automatic notifications or reminders to users
- 95 about important developments in their cases, such as when (a) a new document submitted

4



| 96 | by another party is available to view; (b) an agency notice or order is available to view; |
|-----|--|
| 97 | (c) a filing deadline is approaching; (d) a meeting, conference, hearing, or other |
| 98 | appointment is scheduled; (e) an appointment is upcoming; and (f) a case status changes. |
| 99 | Notifications and reminders should be sent through an online self-service portal, by |
| 100 | email, and/or by text message, according to user preferences. |

Developing and Improving Online Processes

- 101 19. When designing and implementing online processes, agencies should consult potential 102 users and relevant stakeholders, including parties, representatives, adjudicators and 103 adjudicative staff, agency personnel who represent the government in adjudicative 104 proceedings, and personnel who provide customer service or oversee customer 105 experience functions for the agency. Agencies should also continuously solicit feedback from users on their online processes, for example through online surveys and listening 106 107 sessions, and should use that feedback to identify and prioritize improvements. 20. When designing or working with a contractor to design their online processes, agencies 108 109 should create systems that can be expanded to incorporate new technologies without
- 110 requiring replacement.111 21. Agencies should ensure that their online processes function on multiple platforms
- 112 including, when practicable, on mobile devices.

Guidance, Training, and Outreach

- 22. Agencies should update their rules of practice to permit or, when appropriate, require theuse of online processes.
- 23. Agencies should develop self-help materials (e.g., instruction manuals, reference guides,
 instructional videos) and, if needed, hold training sessions to help agency personnel and
 members of the public understand how to use the agency's online processes. Materials
- 118 intended for public users should be posted in an appropriate location on the agency's
- 119 website and made accessible through any online self-help portal.

5



| 120 | 24. Agencies should conduct public outreach if needed to encourage parties and |
|-----|---|
| 121 | representatives to adopt their online processes, in particular prior to making an online |
| 122 | process mandatory. |
| 123 | 25. Agencies should make staff available to help agency personnel and members of the |
| 124 | public use online processes and should clarify when assistance is available (e.g., during |

125 normal business hours).